

# IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE FIFTH CIRCUIT

Ned Comer, et al., Plaintiffs-Appellants

v.

Murphy Oil U.S.A., et al., Defendants-Appellees

On Appeal from the United States District Court for the Southern District of Mississippi

BRIEF OF AMICI CURIAE THE AMERICAN FARM BUREAU FEDERATION, NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF MANUFACTURERS, AND AMERICAN TORT REFORM ASSOCIATION AS JOINDER TO AMICI CURIAE OF EDISON ELECTRIC INSTITUTE, THE AMERICAN PUBLIC POWER ASSOCIATION AND THE NATIONAL RURAL ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE ASSOCIATION IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS-APPELLEES' PETITIONS FOR REHEARING EN BANC

# Douglas A. Henderson\*

Troutman Sanders LLP 600 Peachtree Street, Suite 5200 Atlanta, GA 30308-2216 (404) 885-3000 \*Admission Pending

Counsel for Amici The American Farm Bureau Federation, National Association of Manufacturers, and American Tort Reform Association

# IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE FIFTH CIRCUIT

Ned Comer, et al., Plaintiffs-Appellants

v.

Murphy Oil U.S.A., et al., Defendants-Appellees

On Appeal from the United States District Court for the Southern District of Mississippi

BRIEF OF AMICI CURIAE THE AMERICAN FARM BUREAU FEDERATION, NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF MANUFACTURERS, AND AMERICAN TORT REFORM ASSOCIATION AS JOINDER TO AMICI CURIAE OF EDISON ELECTRIC INSTITUTE, THE AMERICAN PUBLIC POWER ASSOCIATION AND THE NATIONAL RURAL ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE ASSOCIATION IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS-APPELLEES' PETITIONS FOR REHEARING EN BANC

Douglas A. Henderson\*

Troutman Sanders LLP 600 Peachtree Street, Suite 5200 Atlanta, GA 30308-2216 (404) 885-3000 \*Admission Pending

Counsel for Amici The American Farm Bureau Federation, National Association of Manufacturers, and American Tort Reform Association

## CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PARTIES

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 26.1 and Fifth Circuit Rules 27.4 and 28.2.1, counsel for *Amici* certifies that the following persons and entities are interested in the outcome of this case. These representations are made so the judges of this Court may evaluate possible disqualification or recusal.

#### Amici Curiae

American Farm Bureau Federation
American Public Power Association
American Tort Reform Association
Edison Electric Institute
National Association of Manufacturers
National Rural Electric Cooperative Association

#### Counsel for Amici Curiae

BALCH & BINGHAM LLP Ed R. Haden Jonathan P. Dyal

BAKER HOSTETLER LLP David B. Rivkin, Jr. Mark W. DeLaquil

HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP F. William Brownell Norman W. Fichthorn Shawn Patrick Regan Allison D. Wood

TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP Douglas A. Henderson

# Defendants-Appellees

Murphy Oil USA, Inc. Universal Oil Products Shell Oil Company ExxonMobil Corp. AES Corp. Allegheny Energy Inc. Alliance Resource Partners, L.P. Alpha Natural Resources, Inc. Arch Coal, Inc. BP America Production Company Cinergy Corp. ConocoPhillips Company Consol Energy Inc. The Dow Chemical Company Duke Energy Corp. BP Products North America Inc. E.On Ag E.I. Dupont De Nemours & Co. Entergy Corp. FirstEnergy Corp. FPL Group Inc. Honeywell International Inc. International Coal Group, Inc. Massey Energy Company Natural Resource Partners L.P. Peabody Energy Corporation Reliant Energy Inc. Tennessee Valley Authority Westmoreland Coal Company Xcel Energy Inc. Chevron USA Inc. The American Petroleum Institute

# Counsel for Defendants-Appellees

ARNOLD & PORTER, LLP Nancy G. Milburn Yue-Han Chow

#### Michael B. Gerrard

BAKER BOTTS LLP J. Gregory Copeland Samuel Cooper Steven J. Mitby

BROWN, BUCHANAN & SESSOMS, PA Raymond L. Brown

BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, GROWER & HEWES, PLLC William L. Watt Christopher Ray Fontan

BUTLER, SNOW, O'MARA, STEVENS & CANNADA Kenneth W. Barton Benjamin McRae Watson

CARR, ALLISON, PUGH, HOWARD, OLIVER & SISSON, PC Thomas L. Carpenter, Jr.

COTTEN SCHMIDT & ABBOTT, L.L.P. Lawrence E. Abbott
Charles H. Abbott

COVINGTON & BURLING, LLP Robert A. Long Theodore P. Metzler

CROWELL & MORING LLP Kathleen Taylor Sooy Scott L. Winkelman Tracy A. Roman Daniel W. Wolff

CROWELL, MUNFORD & SMITH PLLC John G. Corlew Katherine K. Smith

FORMAN, PERRY, WATKINS, KRUTZ & TARDY Richard L. Forman

#### FRANKE & SALLOUM, PLLC

Shellye V. McDonald

Richard P. Salloum

#### FRILOT, LLC

Kerry J. Miller

Paul C. Thibodeaux

## GHOLSON, BURSON, ENTREKIN & ORR, PLLC

Robert D. Gholson

Craig N. Orr

Noel A. Rogers

Daniel D. Wallace

#### HOLCOMB DUNBAR

Jack F. Dunbar

# HORTMAN, HARLOW, MARTINDALE, BASSI, ROBINSON &

MCDANIEL, PLLC

Norman G. Hortman, Jr.

David L. Martindale

#### JENNER & BLOCK LLP

Rick Richmond

Brent Caslin

# JOHNSON GRAY MCNAMARA, LLC

Mary S. Johnson

Thomas M. McNamara

### JONES DAY

Michael L. Rice

Kevin P. Holewinski

Thomas E. Fennell

## KING & SPALDING, LLP

Robert E. Meadows

Tracie J. Renfroe

Jonathan L. Marsh

MITCHELL, MCNUTT & SAMS John G. Wheeler

MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP Daniel P. Collins

O'MELVENY & MYERS, LLP Jonathan D. Hacker Meaghan McLaine

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP Peter D. Keisler Quin M. Sorenson

TENNESSEE VALLEY AUTHORITY Maureen H. Dunn Harriet A. Cooper Edwin W. Small

WISE, CARTER, CHILD & CARAWAY Charles Edwin Ross James Earl Graves, III William B. Lovett, Jr.

# Plaintiffs-Appellants

Ned Comer
Brenda Comer
Eric Haygood
Brenda Haygood
Larry Hunter
Sandra L. Hunter
Mitchell Kisielweski
Johanna Kisielweski
Elliott Roumain
Rosemary Roumain
Judy Olson
David Lain

# Counsel for Plaintiffs-Appellants

F. GERALD MAPLES, P.A. F. Gerald Maples Stephen M. Wiles Carlos A. Zelaya, II Alexander J. Williamson

PORTER & MALOUF Timothy W. Porter

MUMPHREY LAW FIRM, LLC J. Wayne Mumphrey Wayne B. Mumphrey Clayton Connors

The following entities were named as defendants in a proposed fourth amended complaint annexed to plaintiffs' motion for leave to amend filed in the district court, which leave was denied as moot in the District Court's dismissal order dated August 30, 2007.

Murphy Oil USA
Universal Oil Products Company (UOP)
Shell Oil Company
Chevron U.S.A. Inc.
ExxonMobil Corporation
BP p.l.c. d/b/a BP Amoco Chemical Company and BP Energy Company
BP America Production Company
BP Products North America Inc.
Superior Energy Services, Inc.
Placid Oil Company
Kerr-McGee Oil & Gas Corporation
Total PetroChemicals USA, Inc.
ConocoPhillips Company
Atlantic Richfield Company

Pioneer Natural Resources USA, Inc.

Devon Energy Production Company, L.P.

Marathon Petroleum Company LLC

Occidental Crude Sales, Inc.

Occidental Energy Marketing, Inc.

Total Gas & Power North America, Inc.

Hess Corporation

Anadarko Petroleum Corporation

Apache Corporation

Burlington Resources Offshore Inc.

American Petroleum Institute

Oil and Refining Entities 1-100

**AEP** Generating Company

Columbus Southern Power Company

Ohio Power Company, d/b/a/ AEP Ohio

Southwestern Public Service Co.

AEP Texas Central Company

AEP Texas North Company

Appalachian Power Company

Indiana Michigan Power Company

Kentucky Power Company

Public Service Company of Oklahoma

Alabama Power Company

Georgia Power Company

Gulf Power Company

Mississippi Power Company

Southern Power Company

Tennessee Valley Authority

Xcel Energy Inc.

Northern States Power Company

Northern States Power Company

Public Service Company of Colorado

Southwestern Public Service Co.

TXU Energy Solutions Company, LP

TXU Big Brown Company LP

TXU Generation Development Company LLC

TXU Generation Development Company II LLC

TXU Gas Company, LP

TXU Energy Company LLC

TXU Energy Retail Company LP

TXU Portfolio Management Company LP

TXU Generation Company LP

TXU Generation Management LLC

TXU Enterprise Holdings Company, LLC

Cinergy Corp.

Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.

Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC

Duke Energy Kentucky, Inc.

Duke Energy Gas Services, LLC

Duke Energy Indiana, Inc.

Duke Energy Operating Company, LLC

Duke Energy Merchants, LLC

Duke Energy Fossil-Hydro, LLC

The Union, Heat and Power Company Reliant Energy Inc.

Southern California Edison Company

Edison Mission Energy

Edison Mission Energy Petroleum

Edison Mission Energy Services, Inc.

Edison Mission Energy Fuel

Edison Capital

Edison International

LG&E Energy Inc.

LG&E Power Inc.

Kentucky Utilities Company

Western Kentucky Energy Corp.

Carolina Power & Light Company d/b/a Progress Energy Carolinas, Inc.

Florida Power Corporation d/b/a Progress Energy Florida, Inc.

Ameren Energy Generating Company

Union Electric Company, d/b/a AmerenUE

Ameren Energy Resources Company

Ameren Energy Fuels And Services Company

Central Illinois Public Service Company, d/b/a AmerenCIPS

Central Illinois Light Company, d/b/a AmerenCILCO

Illinois Power Company, d/b/a AmerenIP

Ameren Energy Generating Company

Ameren Energy Marketing Company

Entergy Louisiana, LLC

Entergy Mississippi, Inc.

Entergy Power & Light Company

Entergy Arkansas, Inc.

System Energy Resources, Inc.

Allegheny Power Service Corporation

Allegheny Energy Supply Company LLC

West Penn Power Company

The Potomac Edison Company

Monongahela Power Company

Allegheny Energy Inc.

Duke Energy Corp.

FirstEnergy Corp.

Ohio Edison Company

The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company

The Toledo Edison Company

Pennsylvania Power Company

Jersey Central Power & Light Company

Metropolitan Edison Company

Pennsylvania Electric Company

Virginia Electric and Power Company

Consolidated Natural Gas Company

Dominion Energy, Inc.

Virginia Power Energy Marketing, Inc.

Michigan Consolidated Gas Company

The Detroit Edison Company

MichCon Gathering Company

Michcon Fuel Services Company

MichCon Enterprises, Inc.

Florida Power & Light Company

FPL Energy, LLC

FPL Group Capital, Inc.

AES Corp.

Indianapolis Power & Light Company

NRG Energy, Inc.

Texas Genco, Inc.

Texas Genco, LLC

NRG Thermal LLC

Arch Coal, Inc.

International Coal Group, Inc.

Alliance Resource Partners LP

Alpha Natural Resources Inc.

CONSOL Energy Inc.

Foundation Coal Holdings Inc.

Massey Energy Co.

Westmoreland Coal Co.

Peabody Energy Corp.

Natural Resource Partners LP

Western Fuels Association, Inc. Rio Tinto Energy America Inc. The North American Coal Corporation Ohio Valley Coal Co. Peter Kiewit Sons', Inc. BHP Minerals International Inc.

Dated: December 4, 2009

Daylon a Hould By: Douglas A. Henderson

Counsel for Amici The American Farm Bureau Federation, National Association of Manufacturers, and American Tort Reform Association

#### INTEREST OF AMICI

Amici The American Farm Bureau Federation ("The Farm Bureau"), National Association of Manufacturers ("NAM"), and American Tort Reform Association ("ATRA") have members throughout the nation that, in the course of their business activities fundamental to American life, produce carbon dioxide. Accordingly, amici's members are potentially affected by the Panel's unlimited holding regarding the justiciability of tort suits arising from weather-related events. Pursuant to FRAP 29(a), amici have sought leave of court to file this Joinder.

Formed in 1919, The Farm Bureau is the nation's largest general farm organization. The Farm Bureau was founded to protect, promote and represent the business, economic, social, and educational interests of American farmers and ranchers. The Farm Bureau has member organizations in all 50 states and Puerto Rico, representing more than 6.2 million member families. Through its efforts, The Farm Bureau helps farmers meet the nation's and world's ever-growing needs for a safe, reliable, affordable and sustainable food supply over the last 100 years. The Farm Bureau has members, in the course of their farming, agricultural, and business activities fundamental to American life, produce carbon dioxide.

The NAM is the nation's largest industrial trade association, representing small and large manufacturers in every industrial sector and in all fifty states. NAM's mission is to enhance the competitiveness of manufacturers and improve American living standards by shaping a legislative and regulatory environment conducive to U.S.

economic growth and to increase understanding among policymakers, the media, and the general public about the importance of manufacturing to America's economic strength.

Founded in 1986, ATRA is a broad-based coalition of more than 300 businesses, corporations, municipalities, associations, and professional firms that have pooled their resources to promote reform of the civil justice system with the goal of ensuring fairness, balance, and predictability in civil litigation. ATRA has filed *amicus curiae* briefs in cases before federal and state courts that have addressed important liability issues.

#### **ARGUMENT**

For the sake of judicial economy, amici file this Joinder to the Motion and proposed Amici Curiae Brief filed by Edison Electric Institute, The American Public Power Association and The National Rural Electric Cooperative Association. The amici respectfully urge the court to grant en banc review of this matter.

The theories alleged by Plaintiffs would dramatically change tort law and negatively affect business and consumer practices far beyond the energy industry and the parties before the court. The practical application of these theories will burden trial judges with extraordinarily speculative litigation against American farms, manufacturers, and virtually all other businesses; arbitrary selection by plaintiffs' counsel will be the touchtone for liability. The tenuous link between plaintiffs' alleged harm and defendants' alleged conduct is beyond anything ever recognized in

American tort law. Causation issues will also create an impossible burden for judges and juries. Adjudicating such claims would require a fact-finder to balance the social utility and costs of an enormous range of industrial, agricultural, manufacturing and individual activities that are only remotely related (if at all) to the alleged harm in order to assess and to assign potential liability.

Further, complex regulatory matters should remain within the domain of the political branches, as the constitutional power to engage in the balancing of such economic, environmental and international interests is vested in them. Constitutional issues aside, only these branches of government can fully assess the impact of carbon emissions limits on the entire range of emitters, whether energy producers, farmers, or others not before the court. Those branches can also factor in the financial burden on consumers to afford the added costs associated with such restrictions to their utility, food and other bills.

For these reasons, Amici join the Amicus Curiae Brief of Edison Electric Institute, the American Public Power Association and the National Rural Electric Cooperative Association, the undersigned associations join that brief. As set forth in that Brief, the Panel's novel decisions on standing and justiciability transform Article III power, contradict Supreme Court precedent and overrule Fifth Circuit case law directly; they merit rehearing en banc.

# **CONCLUSION**

For the foregoing reasons, the court should rehear this case en banc.

Respectfully submitted,

Douglas A. Henderson\*

Troutman Sanders LLP

600 Peachtree Street, Suite 5200

Atlanta, GA 30308-2216

(404) 885-3000

\*Admission Pending

Counsel for Amici The American Farm Bureau Federation, National Association of Manufacturers, and American Tort Reform Association

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on December 4, 2009, an original, twenty (20) copies, and an electronic version in PDF format (recorded on a compact disc) of the foregoing Brief of *Amici Curiae* as Joinder to *Amici Curiae* of Edison Electric Institute, The American Public Power Association and the National Rural Electric Cooperative Association in Support of Defendants-Appellees' Petitions for Rehearing En Banc was served via hand delivery to the United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit. I also hereby certify that on December 4, 2009, I served a paper copy and an electronic copy of same by United States mail, postage prepaid, on the following persons:

F. Gerald Maples
Stephen M. Wiles
Carlos A. Zelaya, II
Alex Williamson
F. Gerald Maples, P.A.
365 Canal Street, Suite 2650
New Orleans, LA 70130
Counsel for Plaintiffs-Appellants

Michael R. Phillips
Benjamin M. Castoriano
Frilot L.L.C.
1100 Poydras Street, Suite 3700
New Orleans, LA 70163
Counsel for Murphy Oil USA
Counsel for Universal Oil Products
Counsel for Honeywell International, Inc.

Shellye V. McDonald Richard P. Salloum Franke & Salloum, PLLC 2605 14th Street
Gulfport, MS 39501
Counsel for Murphy Oil USA
Counsel for University Oil Products
Counsel for Honeywell International, Inc.

Mary S. Johnson Johnson Gray McNamara LLC 21357 Marion Lane, Suite 300 Mandeville, LA 70471 Counsel for Shell Oil Co.

Thomas M. McNamara Johnson Gray McNamara LLC 200 W. Congress St., Suite 900 Lafayette, LA 70501 Counsel for Shell Oil Co.

Daniel P. Collins Munger, Tolles & Olson 355 S. Grand Avenue, 35<sup>th</sup> Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071 Counsel for Shell Oil Co.

David L. Martindale
Hortman, Harlow, Martindale, Bassi
Roinson & McDaniel
414 W. Oak Street
Laurel, MS 39440
Counsel for Shell Oil Co.
Counsel for Chevron USA, Inc.

Richard L. Forman Forman, Perry, Watkins, Krutz & Tardy 200 S. Lamar Street, Suite 100 Jackson, MS 39201 Counsel for Exxonmobil Corp.

John F. Daum O'Melveny & Myers 400 S. Hope Street Los Angeles, CA 90071 Counsel for Exxonmobile Corp.

Thomas L. Carpenter Carr, Allison, Pugh, Howard, Oliver & Sisson PC 14231 Seaway Road, Suite 2001 Building 2000 Gulfport, MS 39503 Counsel for AES Corp.

Rick Richmond Brent L. Caslin Jenner & Block, L.L.P. 633 W. 5th Street, Suite 3500 Los Angeles, CA 90071 Counsel for AES Corp.

Russell Anthony Archer Kirkland & Ellis, L.L.P. 777 S. Figueroa Street Los Angeles, CA 90017 Counsel for AES Corp.

William L. Watt
Christopher R. Fontan
Brunini, Grantham, Grower & Hewes
190 E. Capitol Street, Suite 100
The Pinnacle Building
Jackson, MS 39201
Counsel for Allegheny Energy, Inc.
Counsel for Cinergy Corp.
Counsel for Reliant Energy, Inc.

Kathleen T. Sooy
Tracy Roman
Scott L. Winkelman
Crowell & Moring, LLP
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20004
Counsel for Alliance Resource Partners LP

Counsel for Alpha Natural Resources, Inc.

Counsel for Arch Coal, Inc.

Counsel for Consol Energy, Inc.

Counsel for Foundation Coal Holdings, Inc.

Counsel for International Coal Group, Inc.

Counsel for Massey Energy Co.

Counsel for Natural Resource Partners LP

Counsel for Peabody Energy Corp.

Counsel for Westmoreland Coal Co.

Robert D. Gholson

Gholson Burson Entrekin & Orr

535 N. 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue

Laurel, MS 39440

Counsel for Alliance Resource Partners LP

Counsel for Alpha Natural Resources, Inc.

Counsel for Arch Coal, Inc.

Counsel for Consol Energy Inc.

Counsel for Foundation Coal Holdings, Inc.

Counsel for International Coal Group, Inc.

Counsel for Massey Energy Co.

Counsel for Natural Resource Partners LP

Counsel for Peabody Energy Corp.

Counsel for Westmoreland Coal Co.

Michael B. Gerrard

Nancy G. Milburn

Arnold & Porter

399 Park Avenue, 34th Floor

New York, NY 10022

Counsel for BP America Production Co.

Counsel for BP Products North America, Inc.

John G. Wheeler

Mitchell, McNutt & Sams

105 S. Front Street

Tupelo, MS 38804

Counsel for BP America Production Co.

Counsel for BP Products North America, Inc.

Peter D. Keisler
Quin M. Sorenson
Sidley Austin
1501 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20005
Counsel for Cinergy Corp.
Counsel for Duke Energy Corp.

Kenneth W. Barton
Benjamin M. Watson
Butler, Snow, O'Mara, Stevens & Cannada
Renaissance at Colony Park
1020 Highland Colony Parkway
Suite 1400
Ridgeland, MS 39157
Counsel for ConocoPhillips Co.

Lawrence E. Abbott
Abbott, Simses & Kuchler
5100 Village Walk, Suite 200
Covington, LA 70433
Counsel for Dow Chemical Co.
Counsel for E I Dupont De Nemours & Co.

Sarah E. Iiams
Abbott Simses &A.P.L.C.
400 Lafayette St., Suite 200
New Orleans, LA 70130
Counsel for Dow Chemical Co.
Counsel for E I Dupont De Nemours & Co

Raymond M. Ripple
Donna L. Goodman
Dupont Legal
1007 Market St., Suite D-7012
Wilmington, DE 19898
Counsel for E I Dupont De Nemours & Co.

Charles E. Ross William B. Lovett, Jr. Wise Carter Child & Caraway 401 E. Capitol St., Suite 600 Heritage Building Jackson, MS 39201 Counsel for Entergy Corp.

Edwin W. Small
Tennessee Valley Authority
400 W. Summit Hill Dr.
Knoxville, TN 37902
Counsel for Tennessee Valley Authority

Thomas E. Fennell Michael L. Rice Jones Day 2727 N. Harwood St. Dallas, TX 75201 Counsel for Xcel Energy, Inc.

John G. Corlew Corlew, Munford & Smith, P.L.L.C. 4450 Old Canton Rd., Suite 111 Jackson, MS 39236 Counsel for Xcel Energy, Inc.

Kathy K. Smith Watkins & Eager, P.L.L.C. 400 E. Capitol Street, Suite 300 The Emporium Building Jackson, MS 39201 Counsel for Xcel Energy, Inc.

Robert E. Meadows
Jonathan L. Marsh
Tracie J. Renfroe
King & Spalding
1100 Louisiana St., Suite 4000
Houston, TX 77002
Counsel for Chevron USA, Inc.

Robert Allen Long, Jr.
Covington & Burling
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20004
Counsel for American Petroleum Institute

Douglas A. Henderson\*

Troutman Sanders LLP

600 Peachtree Street, Suite 5200

Atlanta, GA 30308-2216

(404) 885-3000

\*Admission Pending

Counsel for Amici The American Farm Bureau Federation, National Association of Manufacturers, and American Tort Reform Association

### CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

- 1. This brief complies with the type-volume limitation of Fed. R. App. P.32(a)(7)(B) because the brief contains 360 words, excluding the parts of the brief exempted by Fed. R. App. P.32(a)(7)(B)(iii).
- 2. This brief complies with the typeface requirements of Fed. R. App. P.32(a)(5) and the type style requirement of Fed. R. App. P.32(a)(6) because this brief has been prepared in a proportionally spaced typeface using Microsoft Word 2003 in 14 point Garamond.

Douglas A. Henderson\*

Troutman Sanders LLP

600 Peachtree Street, Suite 5200

Atlanta, GA 30308-2216

(404) 885-3000

\*Admission Pending

Counsel for Amici The American Farm Bureau Federation, National Association of Manufacturers, and American Tort Reform Association